

Halacha Challenge

↶ Cont. from page 1

(As an interesting aside, even hundreds of years ago people had ice to chill their drinks during the hot summer days. The Mordechai³ mentions that in the winter people would store ice deep under ground, and it would remain frozen for their use into the summer.)

The *poskim* disagree regarding the *halacha* of making ice on Shabbos. The Dovev Meshorim⁴ holds that even the Ramban (who holds that converting ice into water is permitted if it's done in a passive way) would hold that converting water into ice is prohibited. His reasoning is as follows. Based on Gemora, we know that ice can obtain a status of a "drink" merely by a person's thought⁵. Hence, when a person wants to convert ice into water, his thought already gave that ice a status of a "drink". As such, when one is melting ice, the conversion is from a "drink" to a "drink", which does not create a *nolad*. Conversely, when a person transforms water into ice, the ice does not have the status of a "drink", so by freezing the water, a "drink" is converted into a "solid", which constitutes *nolad*.

Without disagreeing with the *p'sak* of Dovev Meshorim, HaRav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach zt"l learns that it is possible that even sefer HaTruma would permit converting water into ice⁶. He explains that according to sefer HaTruma, the issue of *nolad* is only relevant when two factors are in place: (1) the substance changes form (from solid to liquid or vice versa); and (2) the final form is an improvement over the original one. Since the typical way of using water is for a drink, converting ice into water creates an improvement, while freezing water into ice does not (doing the latter, creates a "deterioration", since the water will lose a status of a drink).

HaRav Yehoshua Y. Neuwirth zt"l concludes in *Shemiras Shabbos Kehilchosa* that it's best not to create ice on Shabbos, unless there is a significant need to do so⁷. HaRav S. Eider brings in the footnotes⁸ of *Halachos of Shabbos* that he personally heard HaRav Moshe Feinstein zt"l say that there is no reason why creating ice on Shabbos should be prohibited, especially when there is a need, such as when a person is hosting guests. (Note: Making ice cubes in an ice-cube tray potentially involves the melacha of Boneh. As such, that case needs to be discussed in a separate article.) ♦

1. שבת נא: 2. רמ"א א"ח סימן שיח סעיף טז 3. מרדכי פ' במה טומנין 4. ששכ"ה (מהדורה חדשה) פרק' הערה יד 5. תוספתא
הרות פרק ב, נדה יז. 6. ששכ"ה שם 7. ששכ"ה שם סעיף ד 8. ספר הלכות שבת דף קכ הערה שלג

Kids Ask, Zeidy Answers

Zeidy, why in many schools, do 1st grade boys start their learning with Vayikra?



Good question, kids. Our sages teach us that since children are spiritually pure, they should begin their involvement in Torah with the pure things of the Beis Hamikdash.

Wonders of Creation

Slow Loris

by Alex Isaacson

Found throughout Southern Asia, the slow loris is a primate with an unusual appearance. They have round heads, narrow snouts, and distinctively large eyes. Their short arms and legs are nearly equal in length, while their trunk is elongated, enabling them to twist and extend to nearby branches. The loris's pincer-like hands and feet allow it to grasp branches for long periods.



Perhaps what is most extraordinary about the loris is a small gland on its arm. The gland secretes a chemical which becomes toxic when mixed with the loris's saliva. After licking itself, the Loris bite is toxic. Lorises also use the secretion to protect their young by applying it to infants' fur with the tongue. This sort of toxic secretion is an extremely rare trait in mammals and is unique to the Loris among all primates. ♦

Riddles & Parsha Qs

Riddle



What is something halacha requires us to do specifically on Purim (and no other day), yet has absolutely nothing to do with Purim?

Answer to last issue's Riddle:

(Riddle: After listening to the reading of P'kudei in the shul, Yosef turned to his father and said, "I remember how last year we read Vayakhel and P'kudei on the same Shabbos." Yosef's father turned to Yosef and said, "And I remember how many years ago we read P'kudei and Vayikra on the same Shabbos!" How could this be?)

For whatever reason, on Shabbos P'kudei, the shul did not read the Torah. The next Shabbos, they had to read P'kudei (to make it up) and Vayikra. [see Rama on Shulchan Aruch O.C. 135:2]

Special thanks to Yaakov G. for the help with the content



Rabbi Yisroel Alter, the Beis Yisroel (1895-1977)

Yahrzeit date: 2nd of Adar.

The Beis Yisroel is the third son of Rabbi Avraham Mordechai, the Imrei Emes. In 1940, the Imrei Emes escaped Europe and reached Eretz Yisroel, along with his sons, Rabbi Yisroel, Rabbi Simcha Bunim, and Rabbi Pinchas Menachem. After his father's petira, the Beis Yisroel assumed the mantle of leadership as the 4th Rebbe of Ger. For the next 29 years he rebuilt Ger and was a major force in the Moetzes Gedolei HaTorah of Agudas Yisrael.

The Beis Yisroel guided the work of Agudas Yisrael in the Knesset, concluding alliances with various other political parties to further the causes of the Torah community in Eretz Yisroel. Under the leadership of the Rebbe, Ichud Mosdos Gur was established as the responsible body for funding all the educational institutions within the orbit of Ger in Israel. He would go around at night by himself to the various yeshivos and check on the talmidim.

Rav Yisroel, a true *pikuiach* who had a brilliant way of looking at things, left a great impression on people from all walks of life who came in contact with him. His idea was to elevate every person - to somehow become one level higher than his present state. There are countless stories from individuals who met the Rebbe, relating how he had a tremendous spiritual impact on them and how this strong impression will never leave them. What makes this even more impressive is that many of these encounters with the Rebbe were for a very short period of time.

After his passing, Ger chassidim was led by his brother, Rabbi Simcha Bunim, until his petira in 1992. After that, his other brother, Rabbi Pinchas Menachem led Ger for four years. Since then, Ger has been led by Rabbi Yaakov Aryeh, the son of Rabbi Simcha Bunim. The Beis Yisroel will always be remembered as the Rebbe who rebuilt Ger after World War II. ♦

Sponsorship opportunities are available
(To place your company's logo here, e-mail menucha613@gmail.com)

Contact info: menucha613@gmail.com



בס"ד
Menucha
*The Shabbos Table Companion
for the Whole Family*

תשע"ד
פרשת ויקרא

Halacha Challenge

Putting a Bag of Melted Ice in the Freezer

by Shlomo Epshteyn



"Oh no!" exclaimed Yosef. "We forgot to return the bag of ice in the freezer. Now, almost all of the ice has melted!"

"So what's the problem?" asked his brother, Reuven. "Just put it back in the freezer."

"Well, I heard that we should not make ice on Shabbos," answered Yosef.

Question

Can Yosef put the bag of the melted ice back in the freezer?

Answer

If there is a significant need to have ice on Shabbos (e.g., it's a hot day or Yosef is hosting guests), then it is permitted to return the bag of ice into the freezer.

Explanation

As mentioned in previous articles, the prohibition of converting ice into water is clearly stated by Chaza"l: a Braisa in *masechet* Shabbos¹ teaches that one is not allowed to break ice in order to make water flow from it. Let's recall that sefer HaTruma learns that this prohibition applies even if the conversion is done passively (e.g., by merely putting the ice in a warm place), due to the issue of *molad*. Though Ramban and other Rishonim disagree with Sefer Hatruma, the Ashkenazi *minhag* is to follow the sefer HaTruma's approach of learning this Braisa². There is no mention in Gemora, however, of the reverse - transforming water into ice. Of course, we cannot derive any *halacha* from the fact that Gemora does not mention such case, because there were no freezers back then. 🙄

Dedication

To dedicate an issue contact menucha613@gmail.com