

Stories, Biographies & Wonders

**Don't Go to England!**

by Menucha

*The following is a true story that happened not too long ago to someone who lives in Beit Shemesh. He related the story to Menucha. (For privacy, names were changed.)*

Levi did his shopping at Best Market and walked out of the store. He was surprised to see R. Cohn who lives in a small town near the Galil. R. Cohn is a *menahel* of Beis Yaakov that Levi's daughter attended when they used to live in the North of Eretz Yisroel.



After Levi and R. Cohn greeted each other and had a brief conversation, R. Cohn ask Levi if he would want to give a contribution to the Beis Yaakov, and revealed to him that he stopped traveling to England for the fundraising campaigns. Levi was very surprised to hear that. R. Cohn then explained that reason for it. He said that his typical routine before traveling to England was to visit Rav Chaim Kanievsky *shlit"z* and get a *bracha* from the Rav. But last time, when he visited Rav Chaim, he told him not to go to England! Rav explained that if R. Cohn goes to England now, he might get stuck there, because Moshiach may come while R. Cohn is in England.

Sponsored by



David Joelson|052-557-6360

Free weekly publication | Copyright © 2016 by Shlomo Epshteyn | Distributed in Chicago, IL; Beit Shemesh, Israel. Contact info & electronic list: menucha613@gmail.com | Menucha online: www.btya.org | Clipart images © copyright of Walder Education Pavilion of Torah Umesorah.

◆ requires *geniza* ◆

Menucha

A Shabbos table companion for the whole family

Volume V, Issue No. 31

בקר

5776

Halacha Challenge

**First the Ice or First the Sprite?**

*The last couple of issues we began to see the laws regarding melting solids-such as ice cubes-on Shabbos. We saw that although melting ice cubes in an empty cup is a issue, putting them inside a drink is permitted. But we left off with a question if it's permitted to add the drink to the ice...*



Today is Yehuda's first Shabbos in yeshiva. At the Friday night *seuda* he sat next to his friend Binyomin. "Yumm! My favorite drink—Sprite!" said Binyomin when someone put Sprite on the table where they were sitting. "I'll have some of it too," said Yehuda.

Binyomin took some ice cubes from a bowl that was in front of them and put them in his and Yehuda's glass. Then, Binyomin thought for a moment and said: "Actually, I've always seen my father add the ice to the drink, and not the other way around." So he spilled out the ice cubes, poured Sprite into the glass and then added the ice cubes. "Hmm...I don't recall anyone in my family being particular when to out the ice cubes," thought Yehuda to himself. "Can't I just pour Sprite into the glass now, on top of the ice cubes?"

**Q:** Can Yehuda pour Sprite on the ice cubes or must he do what Binyomin did?

DEDICATIONS

- ◆ By David L., for success in learning of Chaim Dovid W.
- ◆ In memory of Chaya bas Mina and refuah sh'leima for Yaakov ben Chaya
- ◆ By Avrohom Ehrenzweig l'ilui nishmas Dovid ben Shimon
- ◆ By Mitch and Tamar Rudy, with gratitude to ה"ה הקב"ה on the birth of their first grandchild, Tehilla Winston.



Special thanks to kehillas Beis Tefillah Yonah Avraham

**Help:** Let's recall from last issue the Braisa—our main source—that discusses this topic (Shabbos 51b):

ואין מרוקין לא את השלג ולא את הברד בשבת בשביל שיזובו מימיו, אבל נותן הוא לתוך הכוס או לתוך  
 ושש - הקערה ואינו חושש - "And we don't crush snow or hail on Shabbos in order that its  
 water should flow [from them]. But one may put [snow or hail] into a cup [filled  
 with a drink] and he does not need to be concerned about [if it melts]."

Is the Braisa being specific when it teaches that that one may put snow or hail into a cup filled with a drink—and not the other way around? Or would the same permission apply even if the order was switched, and the Braisa is just presenting a usual case—i.e., a person first pours a drink into a cup and then adds ice to it? And if it would be, in fact, prohibited to add water to the ice, what would be the reason for this prohibition?

**Menucha's Answer\*:** Yehuda can pour Sprite on top of the ice cubes. | **Explanation** (based on explanation taught by Rabbi D. Ribiat in the book *39 Melachos*): Although the *Shulchan Aruch* does not state that adding water to ice is prohibited, some have a *minhag* to be stringent in this. What is the reason? Looking back at the Braisa (see above), we see that melting the ice actively (i.e., by crushing it) to get water from it is not allowed. In our case, as the drink hits ice, some small amount of ice may melt right away due to that contact. Hence, it is possible to say that pouring water upon the ice is a way of actively melting it. As a result of this reasoning, some people cool down a drink by adding the ice to the drink, and not the other way around. Thus, Yehuda's friend Binyomin had a reason for what he was doing.

On other hand, the leniency of adding water to ice has also strong logical explanation. Rabbi D. Ribiat in his book *39 Melachos* explains there are number of factors here which make this permissible: (1) When a drink is poured upon the ice, most of the time, the ice does not melt at the time when the drink makes contact with it; (2) A person has no intention to melt the ice. (3) A person does not need the resulted water, but rather to merely cool down his drink. Besides this, explains the author, if only a little bit of water flows from the ice, the *halacha* permits breaking the ice—even actively—if a person does not have intention to make the water flow from it (*39 Melachos*, section Migdal David [Dosh 164a]). Hence, Rav Ribiat writes: "There is essentially no Halachic difference between pouring the drink before adding the ice, or placing the ice into the empty glass before pouring in the liquid. Both methods are permissible..." (*39 Melachos*, page 364).

One question does need to be solved, though—would the same leniency apply if before pouring the drink upon the ice, a person notices that some of it has already melted?

\* Note: Menucha's answer is for Torah learning purposes only and not as a *halachic* ruling. To know laws of Shabbos on a practical level, the reader is encouraged to study them in depth, find out the *minhagim* of his/her family and community, and consult with a *halachic* authority. (The opinions of the sources cited in the article may not necessary reflect rulings of other *halachic* authorities.)

Short & Sweet

Tehillim



אֶתְלִי יִכְנֹוּ דְרָכַי לְשֹׁמֵר הַקְּדוּהָ. -- תהילים קי"ט:

*My prayers are that my ways should be established, to guard Your statutes.* -- Tehillim 119:5

"To guard your statues" can also refer to learning Torah, since in parshas Emor on the verse (Vaykra 22:31) וְשָׁמַרְתֶּם מִצְוֹתַי Rashi teaches: "זו המשנה" - "And you should guard"—this is referring to learning.

We often face difficulties establishing a good schedule in learning. Perhaps, Dovid HaMelech is teaching us in this verse the following message: "If you want to establish your "ways"—your ways to the Beis Midrash where you learn Torah, then ask Hashem to help you in it."

This is also a *mussar* for us, because imagine after 120, a person is asked in Shamayim: "Why did you learn so little?" And he replies: "I had to work, I had to take care of my health, I had to..., and therefore my *sedorim* were short." They will reply back to him: "But why didn't you pray to Hashem "to establish your "ways", as Dovid HaMelech taught in Tehillim?"

Riddles



*In honor of the upcoming Pesach Sheini, here is a riddle regarding purity.*

Zevi is impure. He came to a place where he found two pools of water that looked like *mikvaos*. "Don't worry, the water in both of them is pure," said a man with long white beard who was sitting there. Zevi immersed in the 1st one. "Now you are pure," said the man. Then, Zevi immersed in the 2nd one. "Now you are impure," said the man. *How come?*

*The answer to the last issue's riddle*

Riddle: Shimon was born on Yom Tov. Today is Shimon's 30's birthday (the Hebrew date), but today is not Yom Tov! How could that be?

Answer: Shimon was born on Yom Tov Sheni. Later in his life, Shimon made Aliya.